

MINUTES OF A REGULAR MEETING OF THE PLANNING COMMISSION OF THE TOWN OF CLARKDALE HELD ON MONDAY, NOVEMBER 17TH, 2003 IN THE MEN'S LOUNGE, CLARK MEMORIAL CLUBHOUSE, 19 N. NINTH STREET, CLARKDALE, ARIZONA.

The regular meeting of the Planning Commission of the Town of Clarkdale was held on Monday, November 17th, 2003, at 6:00 p.m. in the Men's Lounge of the Clark memorial Clubhouse.

Planning Commission:

Chairperson	Gary Hansen	Present
Vice Chairperson	Susan Sammarco	Present
Commissioners	Lew Dodendorf	Present
	Robyn Prud'homme-Bauer	Present
	Dewey Reiersen	Present

Staff:

Planning Director/Interim	Steven Brown
Admin. Assistant	Linda Noland

OTHERS IN ATTENDANCE: Jim Gemmill, John Brownell, Chris Corn, Adam Wilkening, Jerry Abbot, Brian Rhoton, Jason Harding, Kerri Bluff, Peggy Chaikin, Hank Chaikin, Bob Conlin, Jim Binick, Bethany Duffy, Mark Duffy, Rebecca Lunn, Tom Evans, Mark Randall, Paul Athena, Wayne Schulz, Jerry Wombacker, Peg Sarkisian.

CALL TO ORDER: Chairperson Hansen called the meeting to order at 6:00 p.m. Roll was called, a quorum was present.

Minutes: Commissioner Prud'homme-Bauer: made a motion to approve the minutes of October 20th, 2003 and November 3rd, 2003. Vice Chairperson Sammarco: seconded the motion. The motion passed unanimously.

Public Comment: None

Chairperson's Report: None

Planning Director's Report: Interim Director Steven Brown reminded the Commission of a Special Joint meeting with Council on Tuesday, November, 25th, 2003 at 6:00 p.m. The meeting with the Council will be a worksession. The Council tries to meeting with the Commission and Boards following the Strategic Planning Retreat each year to discuss the upcoming year.

Interim Director, Steven Brown also mentioned the 2003 Annual Boards and Commissions Conference with will be held in Phoenix on Friday, December 5th, 2003. All Board and

Commission members may attend. Asking all members wanting to attend this conference, to register at the Planning and Zoning Department as soon as possible.

NEW BUSINESS:

Chairperson Hansen asked for a motion to open the meeting to Public Hearing. Commissioner Reiersen: made a motion to open the meeting to Public Hearing. Commissioner Dodendorf: seconded the motion.

The meeting was open to Public Hearing

PUBLIC HEARING ON REQUEST FOR A CONDITIONAL USE PERMIT TO ALLOW THE OPERATION OF AN AUTOMOBILE REPAIR FACILITY AT 1151 HIGHWAY 89A, IN THE TOWN OF CLARKDALE, ARIZONA. SAID LOCATION ALSO KNOW AS YAVAPAI COUNTY ASSESSOR'S PARCEL NUMBER 406-26-313A.

Interim Planning Director Steven Brown, stated this property had previous CUP's for various things, such as a bus terminal and Denton Motor's. The Planning Department has been trying for the past year to have the landscaping, which was a part of the conditions for the previous CUP'S, re-established. During Mr. Denton's occupying of the property, some of the vegetation wasn't irrigated and perished. The new applicant has gone in and re-established the vegetation according to the conditions of the CUP permit along with a irrigation system. Staff is recommending approval of the CUP.

Public Input regarding the CUP: NONE

Chairperson asked for a motion to close the Public Hearing. Vice Chairperson Sammarco: made a motion to close the public hearing. Commissioner Prud'homme-Bauer: seconded the motion.

CONSIDERATION AND POSSIBLE ACTION ON CONDITIONAL USE PERMIT TO ALLOW THE OPERATION OF AN AUTOMOBILE REPAIR FACILITY AT 1151 HIGHWAY 89A, IN THE TOWN OF CLARKDALE, ARIZONA. SAID LOCATION ALSO KNOW AS YAVAPAI COUNTY ASSESSOR'S PARCEL NUMBER 406-26-313A.

Commissioner Prud'homme-Bauer: made a motion to approved the CUP to allow the operation of an automotive repair facility at 1151 Hwy 89A in the Town of Clarkdale with the conditions as listed by Staff:

- Employees be required to park within the fenced area to reserve the paved parking in front of the building for customers.
- If any on site storage of waste motor oil or other similar material is conducted on the property, the applicants should be required to place barrels used for storage of waste motor oil or other similar materials within a leakproofed and bermed area, capable of storing 150 % of the capacity of the barrels, in order to contain any potential spillage. The applicants may propose an alternative to this system of containment, but that system

- must be approved by the Planning Director prior to its implementation.
- applicants must obtain and maintain a current town of Clarkdale business license.
- Applicants be in compliance with any other federal, state, county or Town standard which may be require for this type of operation.
- Landscaping and irrigation system, as shown on as-built drawing must be maintained throughout the duration of this use, and plant materials that expire must be replanted within 30 days. Commissioner Reiersen: seconded the motion. The motion passed unanimously.

PUBLIC HEARING ON ZONING CHANGE TO PLANNED AREA DEVELOPMENT (PAD) FROM R1 AND C TO ALLOW A RESIDENTIAL AND COMMERCIAL PLANNED AREA DEVELOPMENT PROJECT ON APPROXIMATELY 200 ACRES AT THE INTERSECTION OF STATE HIGHWAY 89A AND 11TH STREET, IN THE TOWN OF CLARKDALE, ARIZONA. SAID LOCATION ALSO KNOWN AS YAVAPAI COUNTY ASSESSOR'S PARCEL NUMBER 400-06-053C.

Interim Planning Director Steven Brown made a presentation, stating the property is located at the intersection of 11th street and Hwy 89A with approximately 187 acres of land zoned R1 and approximately 20 acres of the land zoned C.

Currently Permitted Density:

Currently the R1 zoning District with an allowable lot size of 10,000 sq. ft., would allow for the subdivision of this property into approximately 804 lots at an overall density of 4.3 units per acre, if there are no site constraints that might impact their ability to maximize the use of the site. This number of lots would only be possible absent the need to develop a road system and other infrastructure, which is typically calculated at 25% of the gross property area. The property is bisected by Deception Wash, a tributary of the Verde River, for which a floodplain has been surveyed by FEMA. An approximate area of 17 acres of the floodplain of Deception Wash is located on the Mountain Gate property. The applicants have sought and received a jurisdictional delineation of the property, including Deception Wash, a copy from the applicants has been requested. The removal of the area for infrastructure and the 17 acres of floodplain and its designation as open space would bring the possible units to approximately 526 and result in an overall developed density of 2.81 units per acre under current zoning.

Proposed Density:

The applicants proposal calls for the development of approximately 606 lots, for an overall density of 3.24 lots per acre, which is lower than the overall allowable density. Portions of the site would be developed using four (4) different housing types and lot sizes:

1. 118 Town homes on lots averaging 3,000 square foot lots.
2. 210 Cottages on lots averaging 5,000 square foot lots.
3. 173 Home Sites on lots averaging 7,000 square foot lots.
4. 105 Home Sites on lots averaging 9,000 square foot lots.

The density proposed on actual developed land is 606 units on 97.25 acres or approximately averaging 6.23 units per acre.

Circulation:

The Circulation Plan, as a part of the General Plan, indicates that a Proposed Collector Street and Bike Path should be developed linking Hwy 89A with Broadway across the property that is the site of this PAD.

The PAD as proposed currently, includes a street that terminates at the southern boundary of the property, which if extended across adjacent property could make a connection with Highway 89A and another street that terminates at the eastern boundary of the property that if extended could make a connection with Broadway.

With the development of Centerville road, as recommended in the Regional Transportation Plan, there are safety issues to be considered that substantiate the need for this connection, and would make this an attractive solution.

1. There is a fire station in Centerville that houses a Water Tender, and most of the Town's Haz-Mat response equipment.
2. If the project is developed as proposed, there will be only one road leading into Centerville (Avenida Centerville), and if this road is blocked by an accident, there is no other way to access the Town's Haz-Mat equipment, and the Water Tender would not be available to fight a fire in the project area, nor anywhere else in the Town.
3. If the project is developed as proposed, and with Avenida Centerville blocked there is no other way that equipment from the emergency crews can get to Centerville to respond to fires or other emergencies.
4. The fire station in Centerville is not manned, and when the equipment in Centerville is needed, the crew from the 9th Street station must get to Centerville, with no connection from the proposed project to Centerville, Avenida Centerville is the only access.
5. The property to the East of Centerville, which is zoned R1 and could be developed with approximately 75 homes based on current zoning.

Land Use:

The project proposes approximately 54 acres of open space. A portion of that open space is stated to be developed as a community center and recreational facility. There is no indication of whether these facilities will be open to other residents of the town. The various open space areas indicated on the plan, could have some means of linkage, and developed access between them, forming a trail system that could be linked with trails adjacent to the property, and elsewhere throughout the Town.

Cost of Development:

The Town is planning an expansion of the sewer treatment plant, sewer interceptor lines, and effluent delivery lines that will serve this project. Service areas have been established wherein improvement districts will be developed and property owners assessed their share of the cost of

these improvements on a pro-rata basis. The applicant should be required to participate in the financing of these improvements as a condition of approval of the PAD.

Growth Area:

Growth Area Plan identifies the project area as part of a "Growth Area". Steven Brown states this is important to helping to understand the towns perceived impact of this project and how it has developed on the over all character of the town.

Section 8.c says the following:

"The area on both sides of Eleventh Street from Highway 89A to Upper Clarkdale and between Broadway and Centerville is identified as the Eleventh Street Gateway district. The Land Use Plan identifies this area as Mixed Use; the circulation Plan identifies a major collector through a portion of the area to provide access through the area when it is developed. Development of this area would serve as a "gateway" from Highway 89A which is the main arterial access route serving Clarkdale to the historic townsite area. This area is highly visible from throughout the town and development here will have a profound and lasting impact on the character of Clarkdale. This area is surrounded by major roads, is close to the wastewater treatment plant and is bisected by a couple of major washes, which help define natural boundaries t the area. Because of the high visibility of this area, it should be identified as major planning priority to ensure that nay future development is done in a manner that is sensitive to the historic context."

The General Plan states: A Planned Area Development designation would allow a mix of uses, including residential, commercial, recreational and open space.

Impact on Public Facilities:

In researching the issue of schools, staff has examined the impact on schools in Clarkdale. The Clarkdale-Jerome School Facilities Board has adopted an estimate of .5 K-8 students would be generated per new household in the district. With the proposed addition of 606 new households to be added by this project, it could expected to see an additional 303, K-8 students added to the enrollment of the Clarkdale-Jerome District. The developer should be required to open a dialogue with the Clarkdale-Jerome School Board aimed at identifying either a site to be set aside for a new school within the project, or to negotiate an agreement to provide assistance in accommodating expansion plans either adjacent to the existing school, or at another site.

The Commission could withhold approval of the PAD until the Clarkdale-Jerome School Board reports that an acceptable agreement has been reached and sealed. Approval could then be conditioned upon compliance with this agreement.

Fire Stations:

As stated previously, if direct access to Centerville is not provided as a secondary route for emergency vehicles to respond to incidents within this project from the fire station located in Centerville, the Commission could consider requiring the reservation of a site for the Town to construct a new fire station in the development to assure timely response.

Roadway System:

This project, with its main access points located on 11th Street, will have a significant impact on the level of service of that street. The applicants have been advised that a Traffic Impact Study will likely be required which will investigate the background traffic levels, the added traffic resulting from this development, and the impact of other projects planned to use Eleventh Street as their access.

Roads are to go in to the development before and infrastructure. The Subdivision Regulations of the Town of Clarkdale restrict cul-de-sacs to no more than 600 feet in length unless the Director and the Commission recommend a longer cul-de-sac based on topography, adjacent platting or other unusual conditions which justify the exception.

This proposal contains a number of cul-de-sacs in excess of 800 feet, and one that is in excess of 1,600 feet, or over a quarter mile in length. This limitation is a direct response to the need to provide emergency services to the residents of the homes on those cul-de-sacs.

There are a number of streets in the development which terminate without providing a turn-around (Dead Ends). The Town of Clarkdale Subdivision Regulations stimulate:

“Dead End streets will not be approved except in locations designated by the Subdivision Committee and Commission as necessary to future extension in development of adjacent lands. In any case, a dead-end street serving more than four (4) lots, shall provide easement as temporary turning circle with a forty (40) foot radius or other acceptable design to accomplish adequate access.”

Lot Configuration:

Steven Brown moved to strike this section from the staff report. Stating the lot configurations will be a subject of the preliminary plat which has been submitted. Feeling that it is not his place to tell Commission what it can or can not discuss and is suggesting that perhaps that discussion on lot configuration would be better taking place within the context of the preliminary plat.

Utilities:

The applicants have presented letters of commitment for all utilities which they believe satisfy the requirements to demonstrate a willingness and ability by all utilities to serve the project. The letters submitted from Cottonwood Water Works, may not represent an unequivocal comment, and this point require clarification.

Drainage:

The applicants have made the following statement in their Narrative relative to Drainage.

“A drainage report has been prepared and attached to the application. The report indicted that several washes traverse the site. The majority of the drainage tributaries originate offsite and a preliminary review of the drainage patterns suggests that no major detention facilities will be required. Further analysis will be conducted as more specific site design information is developed.”

The drainage study was submitted as part of an application for Preliminary Plat review which was subsequently rejected by Town Staff as incomplete.

The Phase II drainage report that has been submitted to our engineer today (11-17-03), will either support or refute the claim that no detention facilities will be required. As to whether the tributaries will be adequate to handle drainage without detention, Yavapai County Flood Control will likely have comment on that issue. Even if the tributaries are capable of handling the flows, we will need to have the drainage study examine the capacity of the culverts under Broadway which drain Deception Wash.

PRESENTATION OF THE APPLICANT:

Brian Rhoton, Empire Residential Co., applicant along with Jerry Abbot the division President, Jim Benick, engineer and Bob Conlin, current property owner. Mr. Rhoton made a power point presentation showing the architectural plan and overview of the development.

Jerry Abbott, division president for Empire Residential, 549 West Old Territory Trail, Flagstaff, AZ. Jerry stated they came before the Planning Commission to get a PAD approval, stating their understanding of a PAD approval is like a "bubble graph" in which they take the property and demonstrate what it is they want to do in a rough essence. Mr. Abbott mentioned the Empire Residential Co. is looking for a PAD approval, not a preliminary plat approval or a tentative plat approval.

Mr. Abbott stated they want to keep the "Clarkdale Charm" and continue the charm into their projects while complimenting the city. They want to build homes similar to the homes that are already built here. These homes they are calling "cottages, with the front porches and the garages either in the back or the carport. This will be accomplished with a certain portion of the project. They also plan to have a section for standard homes, custom homes and town homes, trying to match the community. The town homes will be put in the area which impacts the commercial zone. They try to stay away from the concrete driveways and use pavers. They are estimating this to be a 3-5 year project.

Mr. Abbott also mentioned there will be a ball field/park open space which will be shared with the community through the HOA. The HOA has the responsibility of maintaining the park area. They all pay a monthly fee to maintain this area. Also their full intent is to maintain the trail systems through the subdivision.

Mr. Abbott showed on a map the wash areas, roadways, connecting roads, possible area for a fire station if need be. Also mentioned they would not be opposed to talking with the school system concerning a school site if it is needed.

Another issue they will be working on is helping to solve the cities effluent water problem. They are looking at ways to improve the plant while waiting for the new plant to be built.

Chairperson Hansen asked if there was any further input from any of the applicants.

Mr. Bob Conlin, Clarkdale, stated he and his brother own the land in question. For many years he has always wanted this area developed into a subdivision to look like the area in upper Clarkdale.

At that time there wasn't the sewer capacity and they were turned down as far as development. They have been approached by many builders over the time. Mr. Conlin likes the idea of open space, and is impressed by the proposed development.

Chairperson Hansen invited public comment.

Kerrie Bluff, 2450 Haskell Springs Rd., Clarkdale. Stating that she is thrilled to see the subdivision come in. She feels this is a wonderful idea. Kerri is also president of Minugs Union School Board and wanted to point out to the applicants that the property resides within two school districts the elementary school district and the Mingus Union High School district which is in Cottonwood and the Clarkdale residents attend this school with grades 9-12. Ms Bluff asked that the applicants include the schools in their considerations and discussions concerning the impact the new development would have on the schools.

Bethany Duffy, 1508 Third South, Clarkdale. Ms Duffy feels the development will impact her lifestyle greatly. Her main concern and a concern of her neighbors is we don't have enough water for the people who reside here now. Stating, this development is planning to increase the population by 1/3 of it is today. She feels the town would loose the small town feel of Clarkdale. Feeling Clarkdale doesn't have the infurstruture to handle to be able to handle this sort of development. Ms Duffy is also not looking forward to two years of construction in her front yard telling the applicants that she hopes the PAD doesn't pass.

Athena Bell, 1400 Second South Street, Clarkdale. Stating, "I have five things to say, greed, greed, greed, greed and one question, why?"

Peggy Chaikin, Clarkdale. Her concerns are the issues of water, run off onto her property, and the natural spring site on her property. She is glad to hear the applicants will be using pavers.

Tom Evans, 1 Hollow Reed Lane, Clarkdale. Mr. Evans asked about zoning issues and if there were any zoning changes from residential to commercial being part of the plan. He is also concerned about the density and concerned the number of homes is too many and feels that more open space could be left. Mr. Evans is also concerned about circulations issues and feels access should only be from 89A and that 11th street should not be affected. Feels the hillside should not be cut up. With the wind and the lay of the land, there will be a dust issue for years during development. With water issues, a waste treatment plant needed to serve this project, Mr. Evans feels this PAD should not be approved.

Mark Duffy, 1508 Third South, Clarkdale is concerned that the developers come in and make their money and they are gone. The residents of Clarkdale are the ones that have to live here with their legacy.

With no further public comment, Chairperson Hansen asked for a motion to close the public hearing. Vice Chairperson Sammarco: made a motion to close the public hearing. Commissioner Prud'homme-Bauer: seconded the motion. The motion passed unanimously.

Interim Planning Director, Steven Brown, wanted to make it clear that the provisions for open space are highly generous.

CONSIDERATION AND POSSIBLE ACTION ON ZONING CHANGE TO PLANNED AREA DEVELOPMENT (PAD) FROM R1 AND C TO ALLOW A RESIDENTIAL AND COMMERCIAL PLANNED AREA DEVELOPMENT PROJECT ON APPROXIMATELY 200 ACRES AT THE INTERSECTION OF STATE HIGHWAY 89A AND 11TH STREET, IN THE TOWN OF CLARKDALE, ARIZONA. SAID LOCATION ALSO KNOWN AS YAVAPAI COUNTY ASSESSOR'S PARCEL NUMBER 400-06-053C.

Discussion between the Commission members and applicants continued with questions on price range of the units, sewage questions, water questions, street parking, dust control, landscape buffers on commercial areas, traffic influence on Centerville, HOA's, habitat impact and landscape.

Commissioner Prud'homme-Bauer suggested the park area be open to the public. Mr. Abbott mentioned the recreational use would be for residents only since they would be paying dues. Ms Prud'homme-Bauer also has concerns on the natural springs and the impact on them with hopes this would be taken into consideration. Commissioner Prud'homme-Bauer also suggests the applicants do have discussions with the schools.

Jerry Abbott stated there is currently a traffic study going on.

Interim Planning Director Steven Brown suggested the Centerville Action Committee be a part of the discussion and be able to share their concerns and issues. Mr. Brown also stated all departments haven't reviewed the PAD. The fire and police departments need to review the process and will most likely have concerns on access.

Commissioner Prud'homme-Bauer: made a motion to table the final decision until the December regular meeting which is the third Monday of the month and direct staff to get comments from the other departments to have at that meeting and for the applicant to take into consideration some of the issues mentioned and to outline them in writing for the next meeting. Commissioner Dodendorf: seconded the motion. The motion passed unanimously.

ADJOURNMENT

With no further business the meeting was adjourned at 8:13 p.m.

APPROVED BY:

Gary Hansen
Chairperson

SUBMITTED BY:

Linda Noland
Administrative Assistant